



DEFENSE POW/MIA ACCOUNTING AGENCY

2300 DEFENSE PENTAGON
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20301-2000

28 November 2017

MEMORANDUM FOR RECORD

From: Camillia Rodgers, Historian, Asia-Pacific Operations; Paul Emanovsky, Anthropologist; Laboratory, DPAA

To: Science Director and Asia-Pacific Director, DPAA

Subj: DISINTERMENT OF EIGHT UNKNOWNNS ASSOCIATED WITH COMMON GRAVE 704 CABANATUAN CAMP #1 CEMETERY

1. Executive Summary

The Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA) is recommending the disinterment of eight unknowns, United States Armed Forces (USAF) Cemetery Manila #2 Unknowns X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156, associated with individuals purportedly buried in Cabanatuan Camp #1 Cemetery, Common Grave (CG) 704, for comparison with the eight unresolved individuals associated with this grave (Table 1). According to the reports of death, each of the unresolved casualties died in the Philippine Islands as a Prisoner of War (POW) on 1 November 1942. The “Cabanatuan Death Report” indicated that based on the casualties’ recorded dates and times of death, they were buried in CG 704.¹ At this time, it is recommended that the initial casualty associations be limited to those unresolved casualties correlated with CG 704 (Table 1). The FRS has been requested for the remaining two unresolved casualties associated with this common grave. This case exceeds the 60% threshold for group remains, supporting the conclusion that it is more likely than not that the DOD can identify the unknown remains associated with CG 704, if exhumed.² Therefore, it is recommended that the unknowns associated with CG 704 be exhumed from the Manila American Cemetery and Memorial (MACM) for transport to the DPAA Laboratory for forensic analysis.

Table 1. Final List of Unresolved U.S. Casualties Associated with Common Grave 704 Summary of Analytical Options for the Individuals				
Name	Historical Analysis	Anthropological Analysis	Dental Analysis	Chest Radiograph*
Bruntmyer, Lloyd R.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Calkins, William E.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Clark, Walter L.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Doyash, Harold W.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Erwin, Kenneth G.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Hennessey, Harland J.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Smith, Henry J.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
Winters, Charles B.	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A

Green shade = line of testing has evidence present to support possible association, yellow shade = line of testing may become possible and/or may be probative. *Although copies of chest radiographs are sometimes included in personnel records, these findings have been rare in World War II casualties.



Figure 1. Map of Cabanatuan Camp No. 1 Cemetery created by the 111th Quartermaster Graves Registration Platoon in August 1945, with CG 704 circled in red.

2. Cabanatuan Camp #1

Cabanatuan Prison Camp—which was actually three separate camps—was located sixty miles north of Manila and several miles east of the city of Cabanatuan. Camp #1 was the largest camp for American POWs during the war.³ Initially, Cabanatuan burial details interred all POWs who died within a given twenty-four-hour period in one mass grave. Between 3 June 1942 and 25 September 1942, one burial day was defined as occurring from noon on one day until the following noon. Between 26 September and 19 October 1942, a burial day occurred

from 5:00 PM to 5:00 PM, and from 19 October 1942 until the camp closed, a burial day occurred from midnight to midnight. Japanese guards at Cabanatuan did not initially allow POW burial details to erect markers on the shallow graves, nor did the captive Americans inter remains in any organized plot structure or particular order. Burial details were unable to record numerous deaths, burials, and graves during the camp's early months.⁴

Captain Robert E. Conn, a POW who served as Graves Registration Officer at Cabanatuan from November 1942 until 16 October 1944, created what is now known as the "Cabanatuan Death Report." After August 1942, Japanese guards allowed the Americans to bury their dead in a systematic order; they also permitted them to erect grave markers. Record-keeping seemed to improve thereafter. Captain Conn interviewed POWs who had served as earlier burial details in an effort to obtain information about previous grave locations and burials. Successive investigations, both by POWs during the war and the American Graves Registration Service (AGRS) after the Japanese surrender, had a difficult time locating and delineating the boundaries and burial dates of specific plots. Attempts to associate individuals who died within a twenty-four-hour burial period with a specific grave revealed numerous inconsistencies and errors with this interment practice. Captain Conn believed that he could somewhat confidently confirm burial reports only from August 1942 onwards.⁵ The numerous discrepancies in the documentary record have encouraged DPAA to pursue disinterment of all Cabanatuan unknowns, as was done in the USS *Oklahoma* case.

When the 111th Quartermaster Graves Registration Platoon disinterred Cabanatuan between December 1945 and March 1946, it discovered that the camp cemetery was situated in an area with a high water table. The condition of the remains, consequently, were extremely poor. Platoon members examined remains upon disinterment and created tooth charts. All remains then moved to Manila #2, which was located twelve miles north of Manila.⁶ From Manila #2, remains went to the Manila Mausoleum and Central Identification Point (CIP) at Nichols Field, where AGRS personnel processed them. There was evidence of some commingling among the remains, and investigators noted discrepancies between the graves from which resolved individuals had been identified and the graves in which they expected them to be interred based on the reported temporal burial periods.⁷ When the Memorial Division rejected proposed identifications, the AGRS permanently interred the unidentified Cabanatuan remains as unknowns in the MACM.⁸

3. Common Grave 704

The "Cabanatuan Death Report" noted that ten casualties were buried in CG 704 at the Cabanatuan POW Camp Cemetery.⁹ American Graves Registration Service officials identified two casualties from this common grave, and eight were unidentified and classified as Unknowns X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156. Unknown X-3156 was initially reported as X-694 Manila #2 due to a reporting or clerical error which was later corrected.¹⁰ According to both the "Roster of Burials U.S. Military Cemeteries Overseas" and the "Cabanatuan Death Report," ten individuals died in Camp #1 on 1 November 1942, between the hours of 8:30 AM and 10:00 PM, and were reportedly buried in CG 704.¹¹ On that date, a burial day should have lasted from 12:00 AM one day until 12:00 AM the next day. All of the ten casualties' dates and times of death would associate them with CG 704.

The two individuals identified from CG 704 were Corporal (Cpl) Paul Blaho and Private (Pvt) Thomas O'Hara. They were identified by their identification tags.¹² The eight unidentified casualties from CG 704 are as follows: Private First Class (Pfc) Lloyd R. Bruntmyer, Pfc Harold W. Doyash, Pfc Charles B. Winters, Private (Pvt) Harland Hennessey, Pvt William E. Calkins, Pvt Henry J. Smith, Cpl Kenneth G. Erwin, and Cpl Walter Clark.¹³ Attempts were made to associate these individuals with unknowns recovered from CG 704, in addition to comparing them with unidentified remains recovered from other common graves. Nevertheless, the AGRS was not able to associate these casualties with any other remains recovered from the Cabanatuan POW Camp Cemetery.

In their 1946 review of the remains, graves registration personnel believed the eight unknowns recovered from CG 704 to be associated with the following eight individuals also associated with the same common grave: X-605 was believed to be Pfc Charles B. Winters, X-672 was believed to be Pvt William E. Calkins, X-673 was believed to be Pfc Lloyd R. Bruntmyer, X-675 was believed to be Cpl Walter L. Clark, X-676 was believed to be Pfc Harold W. Doyash, X-677 was believed to be Pvt Henry J. Smith, X-678 was believed to be Pvt Harland J. Hennessey, and X-3156 was believed to be Pvt Kenneth G. Erwin.¹⁴ However, the remains were not individually identifiable.¹⁵ In processing X-3156, AGRS personnel found extra skeletal elements that were separated into a series of Central Identification Laboratory (CIL) portion designations.¹⁶ Initially, the remains were segregated into two unknown designations with Manila Mausoleum numbers.¹⁷ The extra elements were initially assigned Manila Mausoleum number X-2454-B, before later being designated CIL #320, while the rest of the remains were assigned Manila Mausoleum number X-2454-A. However, the remains re-designated as X-2454-A were buried under the Manila #2 designation X-3156 (see Table 3).¹⁸ The unknown file for X-3156 also indicates that while processing X-2454, additional skeletal elements that could not be properly associated were removed and assigned CIL #542.¹⁹ Another form stated the eight unidentified remains from CG 704 were examined, and the improperly associated remains were assigned CIL #522.²⁰ It is unclear what happened to CIL #522, CIL #542, and CIL #320, as the records do not indicate their whereabouts.²¹ However, "All CIL remains from different USAF cemeteries, including from the AGRS Mausoleum, were reprocessed simultaneously during the final resolution of the CIL project," and reportedly buried together.²²

On 9 January 1946, the AGRS interred the eight unknowns associated with CG 704 in the United States Armed Forces (USAF) Cemetery Manila #2, and assigned them Manila #2 unknown numbers X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156 (Table 3 below indicates the original Manila #2 X-numbers and subsequent Manila Mausoleum X-numbers).²³ The remains were disinterred in 1947 from the USAF Cemetery Manila #2, and processed and examined at the Manila Mausoleum CIP. On 4 December 1947, the AGRS stored X-3156 at the Mausoleum.²⁴ On 3 June 1948, the AGRS stored the remains associated with X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, and X-678, at the Manila Mausoleum.²⁵ The AGRS personnel completed dental and skeletal charts at the Manila Mausoleum CIP for the eight unknowns.²⁶ The AGRS examined the remains again in the subsequent years, but individual identifications could not be made. Between 4 and 5 December 1951, cemetery personnel interred X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156 for permanent burial at the MACM.²⁷

Correspondence dated 10 January 1952 from the chief of Memorial Division recommended that the deceased listed in "Exhibit A," which included the names of the eight unresolved

casualties in Table 2, be declared nonrecoverable.²⁸ This decision was made because they concluded that the possibility of sustaining positive identifications of individuals and/or groups could not be defended due to the “paucity of skeletal remains available” and the badly eroded state of the remains.²⁹

4. Present Investigation

Current research has reviewed the unknown files believed to be associated with CG 704, which include personnel records of the unidentified casualties believed to be associated with CG 704, archival documents providing a historical background for the burial and processing of remains from Cabanatuan. This research indicates that the ten individuals in Table 2 should be considered as casualties potentially associated with CG 704. At this time, it is recommended that the initial casualty associations be limited to those correlated with CG 704, as the research does not directly suggest other casualty or grave associations other than CG 704. If commingling exists within the remains recovered from CG 704, requests have been submitted for FRS for both resolved and unresolved casualties associated with CG 704. However, it is recommended that the initial casualty associations be limited to those unresolved casualties correlated with CG 704 (Table 1).

Table 2. Casualties Associated with Common Grave 704.³⁰

Name	Service Number	Rank	Service	Common Grave	Status
Blaho, Paul	7022718	Cpl	USA	704	Resolved
Bruntmyer, Lloyd R.	19048974	T/4	USAAF	704	Unresolved
Calkins, William E.	19020998	Pvt	USA	704	Unresolved
Clark, Walter L.	19053642	Cpl	USAAF	704	Unresolved
Doyash, Harold W.	281424	Pfc	USMC	704	Unresolved
Erwin, Kenneth G.	18049796	Cpl	USA	704	Unresolved
Hennessey, Harland J.	32092573	Pvt	USA	704	Unresolved
O’Hara, Thomas W.	32115031	Pvt	USA	704	Resolved
Smith, Henry J.	6671009	Pvt	USA	704	Unresolved
Winters, Charles B.	6664117	Pfc	USA	704	Unresolved

Current research supports that there are eight unknowns associated with Cabanatuan Camp #1 Cemetery, CG 704, which are interred under their Manila #2 unknown number in the MACM (Table 3). Review of the biological and dental evidence purported to be associated with these unknowns show that there is a significant amount of potentially probative material available for anthropological and dental analyses.

Table 3. Present Burial Location of CG 704 Unknowns in the MACM.³¹

Current Unknown Number	Unknown Number at Manila Mausoleum	Current Burial Location at MACM
X-605 Manila #2	X-4551	Plot H, Row 12, Grave 110
X-672 Manila #2	X-4552	Plot H, Row 11, Grave 147

Current Unknown Number	Unknown Number at Manila Mausoleum	Current Burial Location at MACM
X-673 Manila #2	X-4553	Plot H, Row 11, Grave 146
X-675 Manila #2	X-4554	Plot H, Row 11, Grave 144
X-676 Manila #2	X-4555	Plot H, Row 11, Grave 134
X-677 Manila #2	X-4556	Plot H, Row 10, Grave 129
X-678 Manila #2	X-4557	Plot H, Row 10, Grave 130
X-3156 Manila #2	X-2454-A	Plot H, Row 8, Grave 146

5. Summary and Conclusions

The DPAA has copies of all the IDPFs for the unresolved individuals. Based on the aforementioned historical and scientific information, to include FRS collection, this case exceeds the 60% threshold for group remains, supporting the conclusion that it is more likely than not that the DOD can identify the unknown remains associated with CG 704, if exhumed.³² The DPAA recommends that CG 704 be disinterred from the MACM for transport to the DPAA laboratory for forensic analysis and comparison with the associated unresolved casualties.

RODGERS.CAMIL Digitally signed by
LIA.Z.1410576895 RODGERS.CAMILLIA.Z.1410576895
 Date: 2017.11.28 14:24:05 -10'00'
 Camillia Rodgers, PhD
 Historian

EMANOVSKY.PAUL Digitally signed by
.D.1270233542 EMANOVSKY.PAUL.D.1270233542
 Date: 2017.11.28 14:43:50 -10'00'
 Paul D. Emanovsky, PhD D-ABFA
 Anthropologist

Regional Director Recommendation:

GANN.MICHAEL Digitally signed by
J.II.1150475011 GANN.MICHAEL.J.II.1150475011
 Date: 2017.12.01 11:14:16 -10'00' Disinter

_____ Do Not Disinter

_____ Other
 (Explanation Attached)

Science Director Recommendation:

BERRAN.PHILIP.JO Digitally signed by
SEPH.1022745197 BERRAN.PHILIP.JOSEPH.1022745197
 Date: 2017.12.01 15:52:39 -10'00' Disinter

_____ Do Not Disinter

_____ Other
 (Explanation Attached)

Endnotes

¹ “Roster of Burials U.S. Cemeteries Overseas,” 66-67. Folder Title: 293 GRS Pacific (Cabanatuan), Chronological Listing of Graves; “Cabanatuan Death Reports, Prison Camps,” 37. Folder Title: 293 GRS Pacific (Cabanatuan) Death Reports, Prison Camps (B). Record Group (RG 92): Entry 1894A, Box 619, National Archives and Records Administration (NARA II) College Park, Maryland.

³ Heather Harris and Lisa Beckenbaugh, Defense Prisoner of War/Missing Personnel Office (DPMO), “Casualties of Cabanatuan Prisoner of War Camp #1 and the history of their burials,” 13 October 2005 (Revised 20 February 2014), 4-5.

⁴ Ibid., 7-8.

⁵ Ibid. 8-9.

⁶ Ibid., 10.

⁷ Ibid., 13-14.

⁸ Ibid., 20.

⁹ “Cabanatuan Death Reports, Prison Camps,” 37.

¹⁰ William Sitnek, SPQYG 293, Army Service Forces, Office of the Quartermaster General, Washington 25, D.C., “Subject: Identification of Unknown Deceased,” 30 April 1946. Paul Dobson, GSQMM 293, Headquarters Base X, United States Army Forces, Western Pacific, APO 358, “2nd Ind.,” 21 May 1946, in Unknown X-694 Manila #2 File. RG 92: Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, Washington National Records Center (WNRC) Suitland, MD.

¹¹ “Roster of Burials U.S. Cemeteries Overseas,” 66-67, and “Cabanatuan Death Reports, Prison Camps,” 37.

¹² R.C. Barrett, WD QMC Form 1042, “Report of Interment,” 1 February 1946, in X-678 file.

¹³ “Roster of Burials U.S. Cemeteries Overseas,” 66-67, and “Cabanatuan Death Reports, Prison Camps,” 37. H. B. McNemar, “(Extract Copy), Photostat Copy of Cabanatuan POW Camp Death Report, (Extract),” in Unknown X-673 Manila #2 File. RG 92: Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, Washington National Records Center (WNRC) Suitland, MD. R.C. Barrett, WD QMC Form 1042, “Report of Interment,” 1 February 1946, in Unknown Manila #2 X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156 files.

¹⁴ R.C. Barrett, WD QMC Form 1042, “Report of Interment,” 1 February 1946, in X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156 files.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ The creation of CIL portions was a common AGRS practice for smaller collections or samples of skeletal elements that were determined to be inconsistent with a given set of remains.

¹⁷ L.S. Panopio, “Identification Data,” 2 June 1948, in X-3156 file and CIL #320 file.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Robert Fox, Central Identification Point, AGRS APO 900, Nichols Field, Manila, P.I., “Statement, Reference: UNK X-2454 AGRS Mausoleum,” 12 January 1950, in X-3156 file.

²⁰ Robert B. Fox, Central Identification Point, AGRS APO 900, Nichols Field, Manila, P.I., “Statement, Reference: UNK X-2354 Mausoleum, UNK’s X-4551 thru X-4557,” 12 December 1949.

²¹ Many such CIL portions from Cabanatuan ended up interred in large collections buried in large commingled assemblages under Manila Mausoleum X-5312, but direct references to the CIL portions discussed here were not found in the files associated with X-5312.

²² GRPZ 293, 1st Ind, Headquarters, American Graves Registration Service, PHILCOM Zone, APO 920, "Subject: Identification of World War II Deceased," 20 November 1950. It is unclear where these CIL portions were buried, and given the complexity of how the CIL portions were processed and buried, the CIL cases cannot currently be pursued.

²³ R.C. Barrett, WD QMC Form 1042, "Report of Interment," 1 February 1946, in X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, and X-3156 files.

²⁴ V.C. Aquino, WD QMC Form 1042, "Report of Interment," 13 July 1948, in X-3156 file.

²⁵ V.C. Aquino, WD QMC Form 1042, "Report of Interment," 15 July 1948, in X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678 files.

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Edward L. Berg, QMC Form 1042, "Report of Interment," 6 and 7 December 1951, in Unknown X-605, X-672, X-673, X-675, X-676, X-677, X-678, X-3156 files.

²⁸ Office of the Quarter Master General of the Army, "Intraoffice Reference Sheet," 10 January 1952; "Case History for Remains Considered Nonrecoverable: Basis for Declaring Remains Nonrecoverable," "Roster to Accompany Board Findings of Nonrecoverability," in Individual Deceased Personnel File (IDPF) for Lloyd R. Bruntmyer. RG 92: Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, WNRC.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ "Chronological Listing of Cabanatuan Graves," 66-67. The FRS status was checked using the DPAA Family Reference Sample Tracker on 17 July 2017.

³¹ Burial information derived from Manila #2 X-Files and "Department of the Army Office of the Quartermaster General: Electronic Accounting Machine Report," 15 August 1952.

³² Following the criterion that "research indicates that it is more likely than not that DoD can identify the remains." Peter Levine, Directive-type Memorandum (DTM)-16-003 – "Policy Guidance for the Disinterment of Unidentified Human Remains," 5 May 2016. Department of Defense, Washington, D.C.