

**DPMO RESEARCH MEMO  
SHOWING FOUR MISIDENTIFICATIONS**

**EXHIBIT 6**

**PLAINTIFF'S OBJECTION TO REPORT AND  
RECOMMENDATION OF UNITED STATES  
MAGISTRATE JUDGE**

**EAKIN v. AMERICAN BATTLE MONUMENTS  
COMMISSION, *et al***

CIV. A. NO. SA-12-CA-1002-FB(HJB)



## WWII DIVISION MEMO

Date: 7 September 2010  
To: JPAC CIL, Mr. Speelhoffer  
Cc: Dr. Chambers, Mr. Rosenau, File  
From: Heather Harris  
Re: Historical research concerning Grave 717, Cabanatuan Camp #3 Cemetery (Philippines JPAC Incident 425)

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide historical background research concerning the circumstances of loss and burial of the men from Common Grave 717, Cabanatuan Camp #3 and to request that JPAC CIL management assign personnel to assess the merits of disinterring unknowns currently buried in the Manila American Cemetery and possibly associated with Common Grave 717.<sup>1</sup>

Interest in this case arose from the nephew of Pvt Arthur Kelder, one of the men reported buried in Grave 717. Mr. John Eakin attended the 2010 Family Update in San Antonio. It was his first attendance and the documents he received piqued his interest in this case in particular and in all Cabanatuan related cases more generally. As a result of that interest, Mr. Eakin has, since May 2010, found and contacted 9 of the 10 families related to unidentified men from Grave 717. His interest is in having those families provide reference samples to support disinterment of the unknowns associated. Mr. Eakin has also filed numerous Congressional inquiries in the past few weeks, requesting updates on this case, but more focused on making FOIA requests for electronic copies of all IDPFs of all missing from the Philippines in World War II and all related X-files. He has established a website <http://www.bataanmissing.com/> where he is compiling information concerning these cases.

**Individuals Associated**

Name	Service Number	Rank	Unit	Branch of Service	Status
Collins, Frederick G., Jr.	6578818	Cpl	263 QM CO	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Gutierrez, Juan F.	20843125	PFC	200 CAC	USA	Resolved
Hanscom, Lawrence K.	6137280	Sgt	31 INF	USA	Resolved
Hirschi, Harold S.	19038407	Pvt	HQ 19 BG	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Kelder, Arthur H.	36016623	Pvt	2 GEN HOSP	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Kovach, John, Jr.	20500764	PFC	192 TANK	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Lobdell, Lloyd J.	20645267	PFC	192 TANK	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Nichols, Harvey A.	7009171	PFC	33 QM CO	USA	Resolved
Overbey, Evans E.	13035026	Pvt	HQ 19 BG	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Ruark, John W.	278681	Cpl	USMC	USMC	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Simmons, George G.	19019886	Cpl	60 CAC	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
Waid, Charlie M.	19049058	Pvt	31 INF	USA	Dead, Body Not Recovered
York, George, Sr.				Civilian	Dead, Body Not Recovered

<sup>1</sup> Electronic copies of all IDPFs and X-files related to Grave 717, along with documents retrieved from three archives, an historical background memorandum on burials at Cabanatuan and Camp O'Donnell, and the DPMO case summary for Pvt Kelder were sent to JPAC in June of this year.

### Unknowns Associated

Current Name	Former Name #1	Former Name #2	Current Burial Location
X-812 Manila #2	X-4855 Manila Mausoleum	C-272 Cabanatuan	N 2 69, Manila American Cemetery
X-814 Manila #2	X-4856 Manila Mausoleum	C-274 Cabanatuan	N 14 78, Manila American Cemetery
X-815 Manila #2	X-4857 Manila Mausoleum	C-275 Cabanatuan	L 14 49, Manila American Cemetery
X-816 Manila #2	X-4858 Manila Mausoleum	C-276 Cabanatuan	A 12 195, Manila American Cemetery
X-818 Manila #2	X-4849 Manila Mausoleum	C-278 Cabanatuan	C 5 78, Manila American Cemetery
X-820 Manila #2	X-4850 Manila Mausoleum	C-280 Cabanatuan	N 5 187, Manila American Cemetery
X-821 Manila #2	X-4851 Manila Mausoleum	C-281 Cabanatuan	C 9 78, Manila American Cemetery
X-822 Manila #2	X-4852 Manila Mausoleum	C-282 Cabanatuan	N 14 93, Manila American Cemetery
X-823 Manila #2	X-4853 Manila Mausoleum	C-283 Cabanatuan	N 11 97, Manila American Cemetery
X-824 Manila #2	X-4854 Manila Mausoleum	C-284 Cabanatuan	N 11 190, Manila American Cemetery

### Circumstances of Loss and Initial Burial

The thirteen men listed on the previous page were among the 2,763 casualties currently confirmed to have died while held as prisoners at Cabanatuan Prison Camp, Luzon Island, Philippines.<sup>2</sup> They died at the hospital at Camp #1 on 19 November 1942 from one or some combination of the following illnesses: pellagra, malaria, beri beri, and dysentery, and were buried together in Grave 717 of the camp cemetery.<sup>3</sup>

From the first arrivals at Cabanatuan Camp #1 until its closing, men continued to perish. The first recorded burial at Cabanatuan was on the 2<sup>nd</sup> or 3<sup>rd</sup> of June 1942. After this date, and over the next 12 months, the death rate in the camp was high. The highest death day was July 12<sup>th</sup> when forty-eight men perished in the camp. Because so many men were dying, burial parties worked every day. Usually after breakfast the men would gather at the morgue and organize into four person teams and begin the march to the cemetery. The camp adopted a mass internment system, burying all that died in one day in one common grave. The day consisted of a period of twenty-four hours which ran from 12:00 noon to 12:00 noon or 5:00 pm to 5:00 pm

<sup>2</sup> This figure is based upon data available from the National Archives. A comparison of this data concerning casualties in the camp with information about their casualty status results in 982 individuals currently listed as unidentified.

<sup>3</sup> The Individual Deceased Personnel File for each of the casualties contains specific information concerning their maladies and confirms their dates of death and reported burial location.

after 26 September 1942. The burial party would deliver the dead to the cemetery and then dig the mass grave for the next day.<sup>4</sup>

In the early days, the Japanese did not permit markers or a specific organization for the placement of the graves. After a few graves had been put in a section or plot, the odor would become so offensive that the Japanese sentry would select a new section and the burial details would dig at that location. The digging of large deep graves was impossible due to the high number of daily deaths plus the weakened condition of the men on the burial details. Heavy rains with no drainage facilities also hampered digging. Many shallow graves were dug during the early period, some so shallow that it was not uncommon to see an arm or a leg protruding from a grave. From August 1942 forward, burial details marked, numbered, and recorded grave location information for the cemetery. At this same time, Major Conn, the Quartermaster Officer in charge of burials, also attempted to go back and make records for burials that occurred between June and August. The "Cabanatuan Death Report" is a numerical listing of camp deaths with unit, date of death, time of death, cause of death, birth date, age, and next of kin information. Grave number is NOT listed. Grave associations were made by using the date of death. So, for example, all who perished on 3 August 1942 supposedly would have been buried in grave 1015. Each POW was given a Death Report line number.<sup>5</sup>

Major Conn could not state who had been buried in which location for June or July of 1942. It was not until June of 1943 that all remains were placed in individual graves and beautification of the cemetery started. Anyone buried before that month would have been placed in a mass grave of doubtful location. Without grave markers it became a huge puzzle to Major Conn when, so long after the fact, he was attempting to locate and mark each of the mass graves. During beautification, Major Conn and a large number of the men who had been on burial details returned to the cemetery and tried to locate the graves they had dug and to recall the dates on which remains were buried. Major Conn acknowledged that this attempt to mark the graves was done only by sight and it was possible that some of the areas marked as graves were not actually graves, but just gave the appearance of being an area of disturbed ground. That would also make it likely that areas which were actually graves were not marked. Major Conn also noted that the growth of lush vegetation in the area hindered the finding of graves. Without regular maintenance the cemetery was not entirely clear and visible.

---

<sup>4</sup> Mildred Trotter, "Notes: Historical in so far as the Cabanatuan burials and disposition has been made," 24 October 1951, Mildred Trotter Papers, Special Collections of the Bernard Becker Medical Library, Washington University, St. Louis, MO; and John A. Glusman, *Conduct Under Fire: Four American Doctors and Their Fight for Life as Prisoners of the Japanese, 1941-1945*, (New York: Viking Press, 2005) 258; "1942," undated, POWs, General Records-Cabanatuan, Philippine Archives Collection, Office of the Adjutant General; Record Group 407; National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, College Park, MD; and Major Robert E. Conn, "Transcript Outgoing Telephone Call," 29 September 1950, Declassified Classified Miscellaneous Files; Graves Registration Service; Office of the Quartermaster General; Record Group 92; National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, College Park, MD.

<sup>5</sup> The Death Report was buried when the camp was evacuated and it has suffered serious water damage making it unreadable in places. "Cabanatuan Death Report" Legal Section, Administration Division, Miscellaneous; Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers (SCAP); Records of Allied Operational and Occupation Headquarters, World War II; Record Group 331; National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, College Park, MD. Due to the fragile nature of this document, an electronic copy could not be made. The original is available for review at the National Archives.

## Post-war Disinterment and Identification Activities

Starting in December of 1945 through March of 1946 the Cabanatuan Cemetery was disinterred and the remains were moved to U.S. Army Air Forces Manila #2 Cemetery (twelve miles north of Manila). At this time, a tooth chart was prepared for each of the recovered remains. Matching these tooth charts with original dental records proved challenging. Camp Cabanatuan was lucky enough to have a dentist. Fillings were prepared from old coins or other metals, but more often problematic teeth were simply pulled. Also, many of the malnutrition disorders caused the men's teeth to loosen and completely fall out. These factors combined to create significant changes in dentition, causing problems for those attempting to identify remains using pre-war dental records. Despite these problems, between December of 1946 and April of 1947 Graves Registration staff identified approximately three hundred of the unknown remains from Cabanatuan. Most of these identifications were done through dental comparisons.<sup>6</sup>

In April 1947, AGRS officers staffed newly formed Field Boards of Review established to approve identifications and laboratories were established to process all unidentified remains. If, after dental comparisons, the remains were still unidentified, they were buried in Manila #2 Cemetery as unknowns. Several hundred sets of remains received approved identifications during this time period and were buried according to the wishes of the next of kin, either in a national military cemetery or at a private cemetery of their choosing.

Beginning in the fall of 1947 and continuing through the spring of 1948, Manila #2 Cemetery was disinterred and moved to the AGRS Mausoleum at Nichols Field to create a permanent cemetery and establish a laboratory for the identification process. Here the remains from Cabanatuan were again processed and stored by embalmers. Identifications were again handled on an individual or group basis as recommended by the Field Boards of Review. Only a few identifications were completed at this time, and many of the recommended identifications put forward for review at the Memorial Division Headquarters in Washington, D.C. were disapproved with the request that further study be completed on the remains. The grounds for disapproval were based upon differences in, and/or a lack of dental data for the unknown remains from the graves in which the casualties were reportedly buried. Sadly, the use of anthropologists to facilitate proper identifications was not deemed necessary by the commanding officer of the AGRS, Philippines Command and the identifications put forward from the field were based upon the recommendations of licensed embalmers, who, while well trained in handling the dead, did not have the requisite skills for associating skeletal remains with the medical and dental records of deceased servicemen. It was determined that Army dental records of the decedents involved were "meager and incomplete" and presented a "marked similarity which would probably

---

<sup>6</sup> Trotter, "Notes: Historical"; La Forte, *With Only the Will to Live*, 178-88; "Background Information Relating to the Identification of Remains from the Cabanatuan Prisoner of War Camp and the Reasons why the Current Project was not instigated at an Earlier Date," 25 October 1951, Declassified Classified Miscellaneous Files; Graves Registration Service; Office of the Quartermaster General; Record Group 92; National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, College Park, MD; "Notes on Conference in Washington Office with Mr. Robert E. Conn," 6-7 November 1950, Declassified Classified Miscellaneous Files; Graves Registration Service; Office of the Quartermaster General; Record Group 92; National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, College Park, MD.

compare equally well with any cross-section of remains recovered from the Cabanatuan Cemetery.”

In 1951 the American Graves Registration Service initiated a review of the “Cabanatuan Project” to investigate past AGRS practices in the identifications that had already been made, and to determine whether or not additional identifications might result from yet another reprocessing of the remaining unknowns. The review arose out of a growing sense of concern that all was not as it seemed where the Cabanatuan identifications were concerned. The Field Boards of Review referenced above put together identification packets suggesting both individual and group identifications for approval by the Memorial Division in Washington, D.C. The Memorial Division staff reviewed the paperwork, compared the dental and skeletal charts to the medical and dental service records of the individuals proposed for identification. Upon making this paper comparison, this staff would approve the identification, disapprove it, or request a reassessment. For the Cabanatuan cases, the staff doing the paper records comparisons found themselves increasingly at odds with the suggestions put forward from the field. As the approved identifications dwindled and requests for reassessments grew, Colonel Clearwater determined that an experienced team needed to step in and review the Cabanatuan project.

Lieutenant Colonel Abel and Dr. Mildred Trotter, both of whom had extensive prior experience in the identification laboratories of the Pacific theater, reviewed the Cabanatuan remains available in Hawaii and then moved on to the Philippines where they found that the identifications being put forward to the Memorial Division could not be further substantiated by studying the remains and the accompanying paperwork at the same time. Dr. Trotter was dismayed to learn the history of burials, disinterments, identifications, and reburials of the Cabanatuan casualties. She wrote:

During this entire period, I have learned some of the details of the history of these remains since they were first buried in 1942. This history includes a record of burial, disinterment, reburial, etc., etc., a series of processings with resultant papers for three or four or perhaps more successive years; signatures on the papers which do not carry weight scientifically; identifications made and the next of kin notified; questioning of the identification with recommendations for correction by personnel who study the papers at a distance of more than 8,000 miles from the remains.<sup>7</sup>

Dr. Trotter found the remains to be in a terribly eroded state, first from being buried and left in ground sodden with water for several years, and then from being handled too often during processing. She emphatically reported the remains to be “jumbled beyond belief,” “eroded much beyond a state that [could] be illustrated on a black-out chart,” and in “such a state of deterioration that evidence on which identification depends had been largely obliterated.”<sup>8</sup> Dr. Trotter and Lieutenant Abel declared the project a failure and recommended it be ended.

---

<sup>7</sup> Mildred Trotter, letter to Col James Clearwater, 1 November 1951, Mildred Trotter Papers, Special Collections of the Bernard Becker Medical Library, Washington University, St. Louis.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid; and Mildred Trotter, letter to Charles Warren, 13 July 1982, T. Dale Stewart Papers, National Anthropological Archives, Museum Support Center, Suitland, MD.

On the basis of these recommendations, and with the view that no further field work could be conducted, the Memorial Division ended the Cabanatuan project. Those families who had already been notified that the remains of their loved one had been recovered received remains for burial. The rest of the Cabanatuan POW Camp remains were permanently interred as “unknowns” in Manila American Cemetery, Philippines.

### **Details Regarding Grave 717**

Documents in the Unknown or “X” files and in the Individual Deceased Personnel Files indicate that fourteen sets of remains disinterred from POW Camps 1 and 2, Cabanatuan Cemetery, Plot 7, Row O had originally been buried as common grave 717.<sup>9</sup> Any documents that may have been produced during the original disinterment from the camp cemetery do not survive in these files. The earliest reporting of the association of these remains with Grave 717 comes from the 1946 interment of the remains into USAF Cemetery Manila #2. Fourteen remains are documented to have been removed from this grave, thirteen of which received unknown numbers. The fourteenth set of remains, apparently identified upon initial disinterment, appear to be those of PFC Daniel C. Bain, 33035131. His name surfaced in association with this grave only within the past few days and his IDPF has not yet been reviewed. Data from the National Archives suggests that he was buried with a legible identification tag. It may be, given the history of burials outlined in the section above, that the presence of an ID tag for PFC Bain, who had been reported buried in Grave 717 by the Quartermaster officer who recorded burials in the camp cemetery, was used to identify this common grave as 717.

American Graves Registration personnel identified three men, PFC Gutierrez, Sgt Hanscom, and PFC Nichols, during the period between initial disinterment from the prison camp cemetery and reinterment in USAF Cemetery Manila #2. These three were among 287 cases identified based upon dental comparisons made by two officers from the Dental Corps and comparisons of death and burial rosters with regards to location of burial.<sup>10</sup> In the case of PFC Gutierrez, the “Report of Interment” dated 5 Feb 1946 contains the remarks “perfect upper” and “perfect lower.”<sup>11</sup> The records for PFC Gutierrez indicate that no dental forms (“form 79”) were available for comparison, though his form 371, “Data on Remains Not Yet Recovered or Identified,” indicates that lower left tooth twelve was carious as of 6 January 1941.<sup>12</sup> No information concerning non-dental remains is provided in PFC Gutierrez’ file. Sgt Hanscom’s case indicates that the dentists based their identification upon comparison of multiple extractions and restorations.<sup>13</sup> No height, age or race determinations could be made from these remains,

<sup>9</sup> See, for example, “Report of Interment,” QMC Form 1042, 7 Feb 1946, Unknown File for X-812 Manila #2, Record Group 92: Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, Washington National Records Center, Suitland, MD.

<sup>10</sup> Elmer Fisher and Leonard Citrenbaum, Investigating Clerks, “Manila #2, Luzon, P.I., Identifying Data,” Identification Section, Repatriation Records Branch, Memorial Division, 12 December 1946, IDPF for Juan F. Gutierrez, PFC, 20843125, Record Group 92: Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, Washington National Records Center, Suitland, MD.

<sup>11</sup> “Report of Interment,” QMC form 1042, 5 Feb 1946, IDPF for Gutierrez.

<sup>12</sup> “Data on Remains Not Yet Recovered or Identified,” OQMG Form 371, IDPF for Gutierrez.

<sup>13</sup> “Report of Interment,” QMC Form 1042, 7 Feb 1946, IDPF for Sgt Lawrence K. Hanscom, 6137280.

though the file notes the presence of brown hair.<sup>14</sup> Finally, in the case of PFC Nichols, the remains identified as being him show a restoration where none is listed as present in the dental record. This could be explained by the presence of dentists in the prison camp, though no specific treatment documents from the camp are available. More troubling is the lack of restorations on teeth shown to have restorations present in PFC Nichols' records.<sup>15</sup> PFC Nichols' file also indicates that AGRS personnel obtained a height estimate from the remains present, though no documentation shows the bone(s) measured or measurements obtained. They estimated height for the remains at 5' 8 ½".<sup>16</sup> PFC Nichols' form 371 indicates that he was 6' ½" and his "Identification Data" form indicates his living height at 6' 1 ½".<sup>17</sup> The other ten sets of remains from this group moved to USAF Cemetery Manila #2 as unknowns. Each received a change in unknown designator in the course of this move, with this designation being that which the documents were ultimately filed under (see "Current Name" in the "Unknowns Associated" table above).

In 1948, and again in 1949, Manila Mausoleum staff reprocessed the unknowns associated with Grave 717. During August 1948, AGRS disinterred remains associated with Cabanatuan Prison Camps from USAF Cemetery Manila #2 and moved them to above ground storage in the AGRS Manila Mausoleum. At this same time, staff of the mausoleum reprocessed the remains, reassessing and documenting dental and physical characteristics in an effort to effect further identifications. Mausoleum staff proposed that X-4857 Manila Mausoleum (X-815 Manila #2) be identified as the remains of Pvt Evans Overbey and that the remaining unknowns associated with Grave 717 be identified as a group representing the other nine men reported buried there.<sup>18</sup> The Memorial Division declined to approve both the individual and the group identification and stated:

After a careful review of this case, it has been determined that the dental and physical evidence presented is not sufficiently conclusive to prove the individual or to substantiate the group recommendation. The association of these decedents with these Unknown remains is based upon information contained in the Cabanatuan POW Camp Death Report. Experience with this report has proved it to be a valuable aid for the association of decedents with Unknown remains. However, in repeated instances it has been shown that the report does not constitute substantive proof within itself. Therefore, it is subject to qualifying or substantiating comparison of dental and physical data.<sup>19</sup>

In order "to substantiate the group recommendation" to the 1949 standard, the board reviewing the case would need documentation showing that (1) the total number of remains from the

<sup>14</sup> "Identification Data," QMC Form 1044, 12 Aug 1948, IDPF for Hanscom.

<sup>15</sup> "Report of Dental Survey," Form 79, undated, IDPF for PFC Harvey A. Nichols, 7009171.

<sup>16</sup> "Identification Data," QMC Form 1044, 12 Aug 1948, IDPF for Nichols.

<sup>17</sup> "Data on Remains Not Yet Recovered or Identified," OQMG Form 371, no date, and "Identification Data," AGRAC Form I-380, IDPF for Nichols.

<sup>18</sup> Headquarters, Philippines Command, United States Army, memorandum to The Quartermaster General, 13 Sep 1949, "Subject: Group Identification of Unknowns," Unknown File for X-818 Manila #2.

<sup>19</sup> T. H. Metz, LTC, Memorial Division, memorandum to the Commanding Officer, AGRS, Philcom Zone, 10 November 1949, "Subject: Identification of World War II Deceased," IDPF for Pvt Evans E. Overbey, 13035026.



burial(s) closely represented the number of people presumed buried there, (2) conclusive evidence that each decedent associated with the remains could not reasonably be presumed to have been buried elsewhere, and (3) that the name of at least one of the casualties could conclusively be associated to the group remains.<sup>20</sup>

On 11 January 1950 a board of officers based at the AGRS Headquarters, Philcom Zone declared nine of the men, all except George York Sr., to be non-recoverable. In the case of Mr. York, the board noted that they could not make a determination as to his recoverability because they had no OQMG Form 371 for the sixty-three year old Navy Civilian employee and therefore had no physical or dental data upon which to base a decision.<sup>21</sup> On 26 January 1950 all of the unknowns associated with Grave 717, were declared unidentifiable and, accordingly, in February 1950, were buried in Fort McKinley Cemetery (now known as the Manila American Cemetery). The Memorial Division approved Mr. York as unidentifiable on 10 January 1952 after the suspension of all work on the Cabanatuan Project because, “based on the condition of the remains involved, the possibility of being able to sustain positive identifications of individuals and/or groups could not be defended.”<sup>22</sup>

Information available in the unknown files for this case substantiates the statement above and those of Dr. Trotter in her review of the project. In all ten instances, no age or race determinations could be made for the unknown remains. Height estimates could be given in five cases, but in the other five, the bones were too eroded and fragmentary for measurement. In an effort to track potential changes in dentition associated with each unknown, I made and have included an appendix which shows the dentition charted in 1946, 1948, and 1949. The charts are not intended to be used for identification purposes, but instead to track general notations regarding the presence or absence of teeth and the presence or absence of restorations. Six of the ten files show changes regarding which teeth are present over time. Two of the unknowns, X-815 and X-816 had gold crowns, inlays, and/or partials recorded as present in 1946, but by the time of reprocessing, all teeth containing gold had been relabeled as posthumously missing. The mandible for X-823 had been noted as present with a “perfect” set of teeth in 1946, but was not present by 1948. Three others have notations of teeth present in 1946 which are not there by the time of reprocessing. There are, on the other hand, patterns in the dental charts suggesting that at least some of the remains can be traced from initial disinterment to final interment, but given the anomalies present among the unknowns as well as some of the concerns highlighted with the resolved cases, dentition cannot be relied upon as an indicator of the stable movement of remains through multiple interments and processings.

The historical evidence does not well support a new attempt to disinter and identify remains from the Cabanatuan prison camps. Instead, it demonstrates the difficulties of keeping records of initial burials, a lack of records regarding initial disinterment, and changes in the remains present through multiple processing points. **Information available in the files of currently resolved individuals from the Cabanatuan Cemetery indicates that the evidentiary basis for their resolution was less than secure.** Further, Dr. Trotter’s observation that the remains

<sup>20</sup> Quartermaster General, Memorandum to the Commanding Officer, AGRS, Pacific Zone, “Draft 3d Ind,” 17 Feb 1949, Mildred Trotter Papers.

<sup>21</sup> “Case History for Remains Considered Non-Recoverable,” 11 Jan 1950, IDPF for Overbey.

<sup>22</sup> “Case History for Remains Considered Non-Recoverable,” 10 Jan 1952, IDPF for George York, Sr., Civilian.

were terribly eroded and “jumbled beyond belief and, I do not hesitate to say beyond correction,”<sup>23</sup> does not suggest that advances made in the science and technology of forensic identification could be put to good use here. That said, this memorandum and all supporting historical documentation thus far gathered is forwarded for consideration by the JPAC Central Identification Laboratory with the request that the documents be assessed and a judgment returned as to the possibility for disinterment of buried unknowns associated with certainty to the Cabanatuan Prison Camp cemetery and with less certainty to Grave 717 of that cemetery.

---

<sup>23</sup> Mildred Trotter, letter to Col James Clearwater, 1 November 1951, Mildred Trotter Papers.

**Appendix: Notes on Dental and Physical Characteristics of Unknowns Potentially Associated with Grave 717, Cabanatuan Prison Camps 1 & 2 Cemetery**

X-812 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4855 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-272 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Associated name in X-file: George York, Sr. (no dental records available)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	V	V	V
R-7	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
R-6	Carious (4)	Carious (4)	V
R-5	V	V	V
R-4	V	V	V
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	Carious (2)	Carious (2)	V
R-1	V	V	V
L-1	V	V	V
L-2	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	Missing
L-3	X (undeveloped)	X (undeveloped)	V
L-4	V	V	V
L-5	V	V	V
L-6	Carious (4)	Carious (4)	V
L-7	X	X	Missing
L-8	V	V	V
Lower			
R-16	V	V	V
R-15	XP	XP	Missing
R-14	X	X	Missing
R-13	V	V	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	V	V	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	XP	XP	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	V	V	V
L-14	X	X	Missing
L-15	Decayed	Decayed	Decayed
L-15	V	V	V

\* "Remarks: Maxilla is fractured on median line. L2 is undeveloped."

Height: Undetermined

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimation provided

X-814 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4856 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-274 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name Association in X-file: John W. Ruark (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 1946
Upper	*	**	***
R-8	XP	XP	
R-7	XP	XP	
R-6	XP	XP	
R-5	XP	XP	
R-4	XP	XP	
R-3	XP	XP	
R-2	XP	XP	
R-1	XP	XP	
L-1	X	X	
L-2	X	X	
L-3	X	X	
L-4	X	X	
L-5	X	X	
L-6	X	X	
L-7	X	X	
L-8	X	X	
Lower			
R-16	X	X	V
R-15	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
R-14	X	X	Missing
R-13	XP	XP	Missing
R-12	Carious (2)	Carious (2)	V
R-11	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	V	V	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	AO	AO	Silver filling
L-14	X	X	Missing
L-15	AO and Carious (1)	AO and Carious (1)	Silver filling
L-16	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V

\*"Remarks: Portion of the maxilla from R1-R8 is missing but possibly replaced by denture due to the presence of the plate and the left portion of the maxilla. Upper acyclic denture with acyclic pallet."

\*\*"Portion of the maxilla from R1-R8 is missing but possibly replaced by denture due to the presence of the plates and the left portion of the maxilla. Upper Acrylic denture with clear acrylic pallet."

\*\*\*"Full upper denture found. Civ. work." This charting does not show what portions of the maxilla and upper dental arcade are present or absent.

Height: Undetermined

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimation provided

X-815 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4857 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-275 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Associated Name in X-file: George G. Simmons (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	XP	XP	Missing
R-7	XP	XP	Gold Partial
R-6	XP	XP	V
R-5	X	X	Gold Partial
R-4	XP	XP	V
R-3	X	X	Gold Partial
R-2	X	X	Gold Partial
R-1	XP	XP	V
L-1	XP	XP	V
L-2	X	X	V
L-3	XP	XP	Missing
L-4	XP	XP	V
L-5	X	X	V
L-6	XP	XP	Gold Partial
L-7	XP	XP	Gold Partial
L-8	XP	XP	Missing
Lower			
R-16	XP	XP	Missing
R-15	X	X	Missing
R-14	X	X	Missing
R-13	XP	XP	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	V	V	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	AF	AF	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	XP	XP	Gold Crown
L-14	X	X	Gold Crown
L-15	X	X	Gold Crown
L-16	XP	XP	Gold Crown

Gold  
Bridge

\* "Remarks: Portion of maxilla and maxillary teeth missing from R7 thru R8 and L6 thru L8."

Height: 180 cm or 5'10 ¾" (based on measurement of Radius- 25.7 (Broca) 180 (Rollet))

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimation provided

X-816 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4858 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-276 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name Association in X-file: Fredrick G. Collins (Based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949	QMC Form 1044a 12 August 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 46
Upper			
R-8	X (undetermined)	X (undetermined)	Missing
R-7	A DO	A DO	Silver Filling
R-6	XP	XP	Silver Filling
R-5	XP	XP	V
R-4	XP	XP	Gold inlay
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	SD	SD	V
R-1	V	V	Shaded spots, no writing
L-1	SD	SD	Shaded spots, no writing
L-2	XP	XP	V
L-3	V	V	V
L-4	XP	XP	Gold Inlay
L-5	X (see remarks)*	X (see remarks)*	Silver filling, Silver Crown
L-6	A MOO	A MOO	Silver filling
L-7	A M old	A M old	Silver filling
L-8	XP	X	Missing
Lower			
R-16	A MO, Carious (1)	A MO, Carious(1)	Silver filling
R-15	XP	XP	Gold inlay
R-14	XP	XP	Gold inlay
R-13	XP	XP	Gold inlay
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	V	V	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	XP	XP	Gold inlay
L-13	XP	XP	Gold inlay
L-14	XP	XP	Gold inlay
L-15	XP	XP	Gold inlay
L-16	A O, Carious (1)	A O, Carious (1)	Silver filling

\*"Remarks: Portion of maxilla missing from R7 thru R8 and L8 but only maxillary tooth, R7, is only present on this portion. Crown of L5 broken off."

Height: 174 1/3 or 5'8 5/6" (based on measurements of the Femur (47.4, 175cm), the Tibia (38.3, 176 cm), and the Fibula (37.3, 172 cm))

Race: unknown

Age: No estimation provided

X-818 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4849 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-278 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name Association in X-file: Lloyd J. Lobdell (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	OMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	OMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948*	OMC Form 1042 5 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	X (undetermined)	X (undetermined)	V
R-7	A O	A O	Silver
R-6	Carious (4)	Carious (4)	Silver
R-5	V	V	V
R-4	V	V	V
R-3	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
R-2	XP	XP	V
R-1	X	X	Missing
L-1	X	X	Missing
L-2	XP	XP	V
L-3	V	V	V
L-4	V	V	V
L-5	V	V	V
L-6	X (undetermined)	X(undetermined)	V
L-7	Carious (2)	Carious (2)	Missing
L-8	A O	A O	Silver
Lower			
R-16	XP	XP	Silver
R-15	A ODF	A ODF	Silver
R-14	X	X	Missing
R-13	V	V	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
L-9	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	V	V	V
L-14	X	X	Missing
L-15	A OF	A OF	Silver
L-16	A O	A O	Silver

\*“Remarks: R6, R7, L7, and L8 are found loose.”

Height: 5'7 5/8" (based upon measurement of a tibia 37.7 (Broca), 172 cm (Rollet))

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided

X-820 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4850 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-280 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name Association in X-file: Charles M. Waid (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948*	QMC Form 1042 2 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	X (Undetermined)	X (Undetermined)	Silver
R-7	X (Undetermined)	X (Undetermined)	Missing
R-6	A L	A L	Silver
R-5	A DO	A DO	Silver
R-4	X	X	Missing
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	V	V	V
R-1	S M	S M	Silicate
L-1	S M, Carious (1)	S M, Carious (1)	Silicate
L-2	V	V	V
L-3	V	V	V
L-4	A DO	A DO	Silver
L-5	A DO, Carious (1)	A DO, Carious (1)	Silver
L-6	A MOOO	A MOOO	Silver
L-7	A O	A O	Silver
L-8	X (Undetermined)	X (Undetermined)	Silver
Lower			
R-16	A OF, Carious (1)	A OF, Carious (1)	Missing
R-15	X	X	Silver
R-14	A MOF	A MOF	Silver
R-13	XP	XP	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	XP	XP	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	A DO	A DO	Silver
L-13	V	V	V
L-14	A MOF, Carious (2)	A MOF, Carious (2)	Silver
L-15	X	X	Missing
L-16	XP	XP	Silver

\*“Remarks: R6, L6, and L7 are found loose teeth.”

Height: undetermined

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided



X-821 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4851 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-281 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name association in X-file: Arthur H. Kelder (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 48	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 46
Upper			
R-8	Decayed	Decayed	V
R-7	X	X	Missing
R-6	A ODFL, Carious (1)	A ODFL, Carious (1)	Silver
R-5	X	X	Missing
R-4	A OD	A OD	Silver
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	V	V	V
R-1	V	V	V
L-1	V	V	V
L-2	S ML	S ML	Marked, no text
L-3	V	V	V
L-4	A OD, Carious (1)	A OD, Carious (1)	Silver
L-5	A MO (chipped)	A MO (chipped)	Silver
L-6	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V
L-7	A MODFL	A MODFL	Silver
L-8	XP	XP	Missing
Lower			
R-16	XP	XP	Missing
R-15	X	X	Missing
R-14	A MODFL	A MODFL	Silver
R-13	A O	A O	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	V	V	V
L-9	V	V	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	V	V	V
L-14	A MODFL	A MODFL	Silver
L-15	V	V	V
L-16	Carious (1)	Carious (1)	V

\*"Remarks: Maxilla is fractured on median line. Portions of the maxilla on R8 and L7-L8 are missing. R8 and L7 are present with remains."

"Unable to determine height due to decomposition of long bones." (Note: Skeletal chart does not show this decomposition. It presents an image of a fairly intact skeleton with fragmented ribs.)

Height: Undetermined

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided

X-822 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4852 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-282 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name association in X-file: John Kovach, Jr. (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 49*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 48*	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 46
Upper			
R-8	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	V
R-7	X(undetermined)	X(undetermined)	V
R-6	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	V
R-5	V	V	V
R-4	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	V
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	V	V	V
R-1	V	V	V
L-1	V	V	V
L-2	V	V	V
L-3	V	V	V
L-4	X(undetermined)	X(undetermined)	Silver
L-5	X(undetermined)	X(undetermined)	Missing
L-6	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	Missing
L-7	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	V
L-8	X(undetermined)	X(undetermined)	Missing
Lower			
R-16	Impacted	Impacted	V
R-15	A O	A O	Silver
R-14	A O	A O	Silver
R-13	V	V	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	XP	XP	V
R-9	XP	XP	V
L-9	XP	XP	V
L-10	XP	XP	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	XP	XP	V
L-14	X	X	Missing
L-15	V	V	V
L-16	V	V	V

\*Remarks: Portion of maxilla missing from R5 thru R8 and L4 thru L8 but maxillary teeth, R5, R6, R8, L6 and L7 of maxillary teeth are present. Mandible posthumously fractured as shown by the fracture line running from R9 thru R12."

From QMC Form 1044 block 15: "Was body mangled? Yes. To what extent? Fragments of bones."

Height: Undetermined

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided

X-823 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4853 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-283 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name association in X-file: Harold S. Kirschi (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949*	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	X (undetermined)	X (undetermined)	V
R-7	V	V	V
R-6	Cariou (1)	Cariou (1)	V
R-5	V	V	V
R-4	V	V	Cement
R-3	V	V	V
R-2	V	V	V
R-1	XP	XP	V
L-1	XP	XP	V
L-2	V	V	V
L-3	XP	XP	V
L-4	V	V	V
L-5	V	V	V
L-6	V	V	V
L-7	Cariou (2)	Cariou (2)	V
L-8	V (Impacted)	V (Impacted)	V
Lower			
R-16	M	M	**Perfect
R-15	A	A	**
R-14	N	N	**
R-13	D	D	**
R-12	I	I	**
R-11	B	B	**
R-10	L	L	**
R-9	E	E	**
L-9	-	-	**
L-10	M	M	**
L-11	I	I	**
L-12	S	S	**
L-13	S	S	**
L-14	I	I	**
L-15	N	N	**
L-16	G	G	**

\*Remarks: No mandibular teeth present with remains."

\*\*Lower teeth marked "Perfect" in the 1946 dental chart.

Height: 181 cm or 5'10 3/4" (Based upon measurements of a femur: Broca Scale- 49.0, Rollet- 182 cms; and of a tibia: Broca Scale-39.0, Rollet- 180 cms))

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided

X-824 Manila #2

Formerly: X-4854 Manila Mausoleum

Formerly: Unknown C-284 Cabanatuan Cemetery

Name Association in X-file: Evans E. Overbey (based on 1946 paperwork)

Tooth	QMC Form 1044a 21 Dec 1949	QMC Form 1044a 12 Aug 1948	QMC Form 1042 7 Feb 1946
Upper			
R-8	XP	XP	V
R-7	XP	XP	V
R-6	V	V	V
R-5	V	V	V
R-4	V	V	V
R-3	XP	XP	V
R-2	V	V	V
R-1	XP	XP	V
L-1	XP	XP	V
L-2	XP	XP	Cavity
L-3	XP	XP	V
L-4	V	V	V
L-5	XP	XP	V
L-6	A OO	A OO	Silver filling
L-7	XP	XP	V
L-8	XP	XP	Missing
Lower			
R-16	X	X	Missing
R-15	V	V	V
R-14	A OM	A OM	Silver filling
R-13	V	V	V
R-12	V	V	V
R-11	V	V	V
R-10	V	V	V
R-9	XP	XP	V
L-9	XP	XP	V
L-10	V	V	V
L-11	V	V	V
L-12	V	V	V
L-13	V	V	V
L-14	V	V	V
L-15	V	V	V
L-16	X	X	Missing

No dental remarks.

Height: 179 cm or 5'10 1/2" (based on measurement of right femur: 48.3 (Broca Scale), 179 cm (Rollet's Table))

Race: Unknown

Age: No estimate provided